

Outstanding Paper Awards

Guidelines for Submission and Evaluation of Papers for Outstanding Paper Awards

Approved by the Sub-Council for Ph.D. Programs and Research

Revised: April 19, 2002

Revised: April 25, 2003

Revised: April 15, 2004

Revised: February 14, 2014

Revised: October 25, 2021

Revised: January 13, 2025

During the fall semester of each academic year, the Fogelman College of Business & Economics invites College faculty members to submit papers for the annual Outstanding Paper Awards. The purpose of the Outstanding Paper Awards is to recognize the success of College faculty members who have made significant research contributions to their discipline.

The Associate Dean for Academic Programs and Research will announce the call for submissions and specify the deadline for submissions.

Award Categories

These awards recognize the diversity of scholarly work within the College by distinguishing between two separate sub-categories of research:

A. Conceptual/Theoretical: Articles that advance the literature through theoretical insights without data collection or analysis.

B. Empirical: Articles that contribute to the literature through data collection and analysis.

These categories reflect the College's commitment to valuing both types of research equally, without implying that one is superior to the other.

If there is uncertainty regarding the appropriate category for a given submission, the Ph.D. Sub-Council will make the final determination.

Award Details

- **1st Place in Each Category:** Plaque and \$1,000.
- **2nd Place in Each Category:** Plaque and \$500.

Submissions

The Associate Dean for Academic Programs and Research will announce the call for submissions and specify the deadline for submissions.

Eligibility

- Articles must be published or fully formatted online between **August 1 of the preceding calendar year** and **July 31 of the current calendar year**.
- Articles must appear in journals recognized in the rankings of one of the College's departments.
- There is no limit on the number of papers that may be submitted in total or in specific categories, nor is there a limit on submissions from year to year.
- Chairs of Excellence and Endowed Chairs are not eligible to submit papers, but coauthors who have made significant contributions may submit.
- Papers submitted for the Preeminent Publication Award are not eligible.

Evaluation Criteria

1. **Journal Quality:** Journals must be recognized in the rankings of one of the College's departments. Supplementary evidence of quality (e.g., external rankings, citation indices, acceptance rates, and affiliations) may also be considered.
2. **Author Contributions:** The role, type, and contribution for the submitting author will be evaluated. Additional clarification may be requested if necessary.
3. **Relevance to the Field:** Articles will be evaluated on their significance to the discipline, including their potential impact, relevance to U.S. readers, and contribution to emerging or established themes.
4. **Other factors:** For example, the quality of data, statistical techniques, and overall methodological approach are factors the PhD Sub-Council may consider for empirical articles.

Evaluation Process

1. **Blind Review Process:** All submissions will be reviewed anonymously by the Ph.D. Sub-Council to ensure fairness and impartiality.
2. **Discipline-Specific Lead Role:** The Sub-Council member representing the discipline of the author(s) will take a lead role in discussing and evaluating the article under consideration as needed, and should be prepared to respond to questions about the article under review and/or provide context about the journal in which the article was published.

3. **Scoring:** Sub-Council members evaluate submissions using a 5-point scale (5 = highest, 1 = lowest). Initial rankings are based on mean scores, followed by discussions and final review. The top two papers in each category (or more in case of ties) are submitted to the Dean's Office.

Submission Requirements

Faculty must submit the following materials electronically to the Associate Dean for Academic Programs and Research by the stated deadline:

1. **Redacted Article:** A PDF version of the **published article** with all identifying information redacted (e.g., author names, affiliations, email addresses, and self-citations).
2. **Memo:** An anonymized statement addressing the evaluation criteria. The following information must be included:
 - Each author's contribution (roles, type, and approximate percentage).
 - Provide the College's departmental ranking of the journal.
 - Additional evidence of quality (e.g., citation indices, acceptance rates, external rankings, or affiliations), if applicable.
 - A statement on the article's relevance and impact within its discipline.
 - Any other information the submitter feels appropriate to address the evaluation criteria.
3. **Title Page:** A separate title page listing the article's title, authors, and affiliations for identification purposes.